



**New York City Economic
Development Corporation**
*Commercial Real Estate Disparity Study -
Appendices*

Table of Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS II

TABLE OF CONTENTS CONTINUED III

 Tables iii

PREFACE 4

 MGT Project Team 4

 Subconsultants 4

 Acknowledgements 4

NOTICE 5

APPENDIX A DETAILED PRODUCT MARKET ANALYSIS 6

APPENDIX B DETAILED MARKET AREA ANALYSIS 9

APPENDIX C ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY BY NAICS CODES 11

APPENDIX D DEVELOPER SURVEY INSTRUMENT 22

APPENDIX E IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR FIRMS 40

APPENDIX F IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR PROFESSIONAL ORGANIZATIONS 50

Table Of Contents Continued

Tables

Table A-1. New York City Economic Development Corporation, Ground Leases and Land Sales Product Market Area, All NAICS Codes	6
Table A-2. New York City Economic Development Corporation, NYCIDA Incentives, Product Market Area, All NAICS Codes	7
Table B-1. New York City Economic Development Corporation, Ground Leases and Land Sales, Geographic Market Area, All Firms	9
Table B-2. New York City Economic Development Corporation, NYCIDA Incentives, Geographic Market Area, All Firms	10
Table C-1. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, African American Firms	11
Table C-2. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, Asian American Firms	11
Table C-3. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, Hispanic American or Latino Firms	12
Table C-4. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, Native American Firms	12
Table C-5. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, MBE	13
Table C-6. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, Non-Minority Females	13
Table C-7. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, Ground Leases and Land Sales, M/WBE.....	14
Table C-8. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, African American Firms	15
Table C-9. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, Asian American Firms.....	16
Table C-10. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, Hispanic American or Latino Firms	17
Table C-11. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, Native American Firms	18
Table C-12. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, MBE Firms	19
Table C-13. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, Non-Minority Females Firms	20
Table C-14. Detailed Engagement, Availability, and Disparity Analyses New York City Economic Development Corporation Marketplace, NYCIDA Incentives, M/WBE Firms	21



Preface

MGT Project Team

MGT Impact Solutions, LLC is a Tampa-based research and management consulting firm exclusively working in the public sector. Since 1990, MGT has conducted over 250+ disparity and disparity-related studies. The team of experts who dedicated their time, attention, and expertise to this Study includes some of the most experienced and accomplished social science experts in the field of disparity studies.

Subconsultants

Brian Ansari & Associates (MBE) is a management consulting firm with over 28 years of experience providing public and private sector strategic advisory services. Brian Ansari & Associates served as a technical advisor and conducted stakeholder interviews, assisted with the procurement policy interviews and chapter creation, and conducted in-depth interviews with developers.

Ebony Marketing Systems (M/WBE) is a marketing research and management consulting firm providing a full array of quantitative and qualitative research services for healthcare, transportation, utilities, media messaging, government and multiculturally specific markets. Ebony Marketing Systems assisted with participant recruitment and conducted telephone/online developer surveys.

Thompson Consulting and Analytics (MBE) is an economic consulting firm that provides clients with a unique mix of core competencies that add value, regional economic research, predictive analytics, and disparity research that benefit both public and private sector clients. Thompson Consulting and Analytics assisted with the private sector (marketplace) analysis.

Create-A-Heart Marketing (MBE/VBE) creates fully automated, highly targeted digital marketing campaigns for nonprofits and small businesses. Create-A-Heart Marketing campaigns help service-based organizations in every industry increase their market reach, audience engagement and stakeholder support. Create-A-Heart Marketing designed and maintained NYCEDC's disparity study-specific website.

Acknowledgements

This study was commissioned by the New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC), whose guidance, direction, and support were instrumental in its development. We acknowledge NYCEDC's assistance in ensuring that the study is both legally supportable and actionable, and appreciate their commitment to advancing data-driven approaches to addressing disparities in the commercial real estate sector.

We especially recognize the leadership and contributions of Shehila Stephens, Executive Vice President of Equity & Community Impact; Melissa Pumphrey, Senior Vice President of Economic Research & Policy; Wendy Star, Senior Vice President of Equity; Johnny Celestin, Senior Vice President of MWBE; and Amanda Martinez, Senior Program Manager, Economic Mobility.



Notice

This report, prepared as per the terms of MGT's engagement with the New York City Economic Development Corporation, is intended for unified reading and utilization. Any separation or alteration of its sections or pages is strictly prohibited and renders the report invalid. Without prior written consent from MGT, this report cannot be used, reproduced, quoted, or distributed for purposes beyond those specified in the engagement terms. While information from external sources is believed to be reliable, no warranty is provided regarding its accuracy. Predictions in this report are subject to inherent risks and uncertainties, and MGT bears no responsibility for actual outcomes or future events. The opinions expressed herein are valid solely for the stated purpose and as of the report's date, with no obligation to update. All decisions regarding the implementation of advice or recommendations in this report lie with the New York City Economic Development Corporation. It is exclusively for the New York City Economic Development Corporation's use, with no third-party beneficiaries, and MGT disclaims liability to any third party for the report's contents or actions taken as a result. Specifically, MGT bears no responsibility to any third party concerning the content of this report or any actions taken, or decisions made based on the results, advice, or recommendations provided herein.

Appendix A Detailed Product Market Analysis

TABLE A-1.
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
PRODUCT MARKET AREA,
ALL NAICS CODES

NAICS CODE	NAICS CODE DESCRIPTION	TOTAL VALUE	PERCENT	CUMULATIVE PERCENT
531110	LESSORS OF RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS AND DWELLINGS	\$1,454,522,692.00	43.96%	43.96%
236116	NEW MULTIFAMILY HOUSING CONSTRUCTION (EXCEPT FOR-SALE BUILDERS)	\$1,045,776,082.00	31.61%	75.57%
531210	OFFICES OF REAL ESTATE AGENTS AND BROKERS	\$394,183,045.00	11.91%	87.49%
237210	LAND SUBDIVISION	\$335,752,499.00	10.15%	97.64%
531120	LESSORS OF NONRESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS (EXCEPT MINIWAREHOUSES)	\$56,900,000.00	1.72%	99.36%
327320	READY-MIX CONCRETE MANUFACTURING	\$21,253,362.00	0.64%	100.00%
GRAND TOTAL		\$3,308,387,680.00	100.00%	100.00%

TABLE A-2.
 NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION,
 NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
 PRODUCT MARKET AREA,
 ALL NAICS CODES

NAICS CODE	NAICS CODE DESCRIPTION	TOTAL VALUE	PERCENT	CUMULATIVE PERCENT
221118	Other Electric Power Generation	\$ 117,686,441.00	26.44%	26.44%
523940	Portfolio Management and Investment Advice	\$ 80,727,180.00	18.14%	44.58%
531390	Other Activities Related to Real Estate	\$ 79,880,409.25	17.95%	62.53%
531110	Lessors of Residential Buildings and Dwellings	\$ 63,170,410.00	14.19%	76.72%
512110	Motion Picture and Video Production	\$ 37,720,055.00	8.48%	85.20%
531120	Lessors of Nonresidential Buildings (except Miniwarehouses)	\$ 28,731,432.00	6.46%	91.66%
339992	Musical Instrument Manufacturing	\$ 10,754,593.00	2.42%	94.07%
445110	Supermarkets and Other Grocery Retailers (except Convenience Retailers)	\$ 9,443,738.00	2.12%	96.19%
423110	Automobile and Other Motor Vehicle Merchant Wholesalers	\$ 3,213,596.00	0.72%	96.92%
237210	Land Subdivision	\$ 2,889,615.00	0.65%	97.56%
424410	General Line Grocery Merchant Wholesalers	\$ 2,701,152.00	0.61%	98.17%
221114	Solar Electric Power Generation	\$ 2,112,921.00	0.47%	98.65%
327390	Other Concrete Product Manufacturing	\$ 2,083,844.00	0.47%	99.11%
424490	Other Grocery and Related Products Merchant Wholesalers	\$ 1,694,162.00	0.38%	99.50%
238220	Plumbing, Heating, and Air-Conditioning Contractors	\$ 1,308,616.00	0.29%	99.79%
423310	Lumber, Plywood, Millwork, and Wood Panel Merchant Wholesalers	\$ 937,645.00	0.21%	100.00%
221210	Natural Gas Distribution	\$-	0.00%	100.00%
312120	Breweries	\$-	0.00%	100.00%
332722	Bolt, Nut, Screw, Rivet, and Washer Manufacturing	\$-	0.00%	100.00%
424480	Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Merchant Wholesalers	\$-	0.00%	100.00%



NAICS CODE	NAICS CODE DESCRIPTION	TOTAL VALUE	PERCENT	CUMULATIVE PERCENT
424990	Other Miscellaneous Nondurable Goods Merchant Wholesalers	\$-	0.00%	100.00%
493110	General Warehousing and Storage	\$-	0.00%	100.00%
GRAND TOTAL		\$ 445,055,809.25	100.00%	100.00%



Appendix B Detailed Market Area Analysis

TABLE B-1.
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
GEOGRAPHIC MARKET AREA,
ALL FIRMS

COUNTY, STATE	TOTAL VALUE	PERCENT	CUMULATIVE PERCENT
NEW YORK COUNTY, NY	\$1,739,613,238.00	52.58%	52.58%
KINGS COUNTY, NY	\$ 711,792,809.00	21.51%	74.10%
BRONX COUNTY, NY	\$435,858,170.00	13.17%	87.27%
QUEENS COUNTY, NY	\$145,604,054.00	4.40%	91.67%
RICHMOND COUNTY, NY	\$56,900,000.00	1.72%	93.39%
NASSAU COUNTY, NY	\$218,619,409.00	6.61%	100.00%
GRAND TOTAL	\$3,308,387,680.00	100.00%	100.00%



TABLE B-2.
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
GEOGRAPHIC MARKET AREA,
ALL FIRMS

COUNTY, STATE	TOTAL VALUE	PERCENT	CUMULATIVE PERCENT
NEW YORK COUNTY, NY	\$241,941,769.25	54.36%	54.36%
QUEENS COUNTY, NY	\$35,907,251.00	8.07%	62.43%
KINGS COUNTY, NY	\$21,053,312.00	4.73%	67.16%
BRONX COUNTY, NY	\$6,272,450.00	1.41%	68.57%
ORANGE COUNTY, CA	\$113,271,685.00	25.45%	94.02%
NASSAU COUNTY, NY	\$26,369,339.00	5.92%	99.95%
HUDSON COUNTY, NJ	\$240,003.00	0.05%	100.00%
UNION COUNTY, NJ		0.00%	100.00%
GRAND TOTAL	\$445,055,809.25	100.00%	100.00%

Appendix C Engagement, Availability, and Disparity by NAICS Codes

TABLE C-1.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
AFRICAN AMERICAN FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	AFRICAN AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	13.00%	8.31%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	1.61%	0.00	¥
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	0.00%	5.53%	0.00	¥¥
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	0.14%	0.00	

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-2.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
ASIAN AMERICAN FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	ASIAN AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	0.00%	13.53%	0.00	¥
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	0.00%	5.51%	0.00	
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	0.02%	0.00	

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-3.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
HISPANIC AMERICAN OR LATINO FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	HISPANIC AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	0.00%	21.01%	0.00	¥¥
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	1.59%	21.26%	7.48	¥¥
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	0.03%	0.00	

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-4.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
NATIVE AMERICAN FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	NATIVE AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	0.00%	0.00%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	0.00%	0.02%	0.00	
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	0.00%		

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-5.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
MBE

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	MBE			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	13.00%	42.85%	30.34	¥¥¥
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	1.61%	0.00	¥
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	1.59%	32.32%	4.92	¥¥¥
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	0.19%	0.00	

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-6.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
NON-MINORITY FEMALES

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	NON-MINORITY FEMALES			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	0.00%	12.74%	0.00	¥
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	9.68%	0.00	¥¥
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	25.09%	22.61%		
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	1.25%	0.00	

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).



TABLE C-7.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
GROUND LEASES AND LAND SALES,
M/WBE

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	M/WBE			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2361	Residential Building Construction	13.00%	55.59%	23.38	¥¥¥
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	11.29%	0.00	¥¥
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	26.68%	54.93%	48.58	¥¥¥
5312	Offices of Real Estate Agents and Brokers	0.00%	1.44%	0.00	

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-8.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
AFRICAN AMERICAN FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	AFRICAN AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	0.00%	0.00%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	6.38%	0.00	¥¥
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4451	Grocery Stores	0.00%	0.00%		
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	100.00%	0.00	¥¥
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	0.00%	5.35%	0.00	¥¥
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	0.00%	33.33%	0.00	¥¥

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-9.
 DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
 NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
 NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
 ASIAN AMERICAN FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	ASIAN AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	94.17%	0.00%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	3.34%	0.00	¥
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	2.78%	0.00	¥
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	5.00%	0.00	¥¥
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	68.37%	0.00%		
4451	Grocery Stores	71.96%	0.00%		
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	0.00%		
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	7.47%	5.32%		
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	0.00%	8.33%	0.00	¥¥

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-10.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
HISPANIC AMERICAN OR LATINO FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	HISPANIC AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	0.00%	0.00%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	7.44%	0.00	¥¥
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	13.89%	0.00	¥¥
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	20.00%	0.00	¥¥
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4451	Grocery Stores	11.19%	0.00%		
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	0.00%		
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	28.69%	21.10%		
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	0.00%	0.00%		

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).



TABLE C-11.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
NATIVE AMERICAN FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	NATIVE AMERICAN			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	0.00%	0.00%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	1.02%	0.00	
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	2.78%	0.00	¥
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4451	Grocery Stores	0.00%	0.00%		
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	0.00%		
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	0.00%	0.00%		
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	0.00%	0.00%		

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-12.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
MBE FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	MBE			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	94.17%	0.00%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	18.18%	0.00	¥¥
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	0.00%		
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	19.44%	0.00	¥¥
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.00%		
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	25.00%	0.00	¥
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	68.37%	0.00%		
4451	Grocery Stores	83.15%	0.00%		
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	100.00%	0.00	¥¥
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	0.00%		
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	36.16%	31.77%		
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	0.00%	41.67%	0.00	¥¥¥

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-13.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
NON-MINORITY FEMALES FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	NON-MINORITY FEMALES			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	0.00%	0.44%	0.00	
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	11.70%	0.00	¥¥
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	5.56%	0.00	¥¥
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	18.69%	0.00	¥¥
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.76%	0.00	
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	100.00%	12.41%		¥¥
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	4.96%	0.00	¥¥
4451	Grocery Stores	0.00%	1.97%	0.00	¥
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	0.00%		
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	1.94%	0.00	¥
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	0.00%	22.56%	0.00	¥¥
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	1.71%	16.60%	10.30	¥¥

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).

TABLE C-14.
DETAILED ENGAGEMENT, AVAILABILITY, AND DISPARITY ANALYSES
NEW YORK CITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION MARKETPLACE,
NYCIDA INCENTIVES,
M/WBE FIRMS

NAICS-4	NAICS-4 DESCRIPTION	M/WBE			
		Engagement	Availability	Disparity	Significance
2211	Electric Power Generation, Transmission and Distribution	94.17%	0.44%		
2372	Land Subdivision	0.00%	0.00%		
2382	Building Equipment Contractors	0.00%	29.87%	0.00	¥¥
3273	Cement and Concrete Product Manufacturing	0.00%	5.56%	0.00	¥¥
3399	Other Miscellaneous Manufacturing	0.00%	38.13%	0.00	¥¥¥
4231	Motor Vehicle and Motor Vehicle Parts and Supplies Merchant Wholesalers	0.00%	0.76%	0.00	¥¥
4233	Lumber and Other Construction Materials Merchant Wholesalers	100.00%	37.41%		
4244	Grocery and Related Product Merchant Wholesalers	68.37%	4.96%		
4451	Grocery Stores	83.15%	1.97%		
5121	Motion Picture and Video Industries	0.00%	100.00%	0.00	¥¥
5239	Other Financial Investment Activities	0.00%	1.94%	0.00	¥¥
5311	Lessors of Real Estate	36.16%	54.33%	66.55	
5313	Activities Related to Real Estate	1.71%	58.27%	2.93	¥¥¥

Note: Disparity index values may vary slightly from calculations of depicted figures due to rounding of presented levels of utilization and availability. "¥" indicates an adverse disparity that is statistically significant at the 15% level or better (85% confidence). "¥¥" indicates the disparity is significant at a 10% level or better (90% confidence). "¥¥¥" indicates significance at a 5% level or better (95% confidence).



Appendix D Developer Survey Instrument

New York City Economic Development Corporation Questionnaire Online Introduction

New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC) has retained MGT to conduct a Disparity Study for commercial real estate. The overall purpose of the Disparity Study is to assess the effects of race, ethnicity, and gender on commercial real estate development firms' ability to acquire capital or bonding, and conduct real estate transactions or business deals NYCEDC's marketplace. We understand that this may be a difficult topic to discuss. However, your feedback is important to addressing whether discrimination exists and, if so, its affects on contracting for minority and women-owned developers in NYCEDC's marketplace. ***Individual information is kept confidential to the extent permitted by law. Your firm has been selected to participate in a questionnaire to ascertain experiences of discrimination, if any, towards developers.***

The survey should be completed by the company's Owner, CEO, President, Vice President, or other decision-making authority with in-depth knowledge of the firm. Questions in this survey relate to company ownership and real estate transaction experience with NYCEDC and in the marketplace.

If you have any questions or would like more information about the Disparity Study, please visit the study website at www.NYCEDCDisparityStudy.com or contact MGT at NYCEDCDisparityStudy@mgt.us.

Click the arrows below to start the questionnaire. Thank you in advance for your participation.



New York City Economic Development Corporation Questionnaire

Telephone Introduction

Phase 2

Hello, my name is _____ and I am calling on behalf of New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC). NYCEDC has retained MGT to conduct a Disparity Study on the commercial real estate industry. The overall purpose of the Disparity Study is to assess the effects of race, ethnicity, and gender on commercial real estate development firms' ability to acquire capital or bonding, and conduct real estate transactions or business deals in NYCEDC's marketplace.

S1. Is this (READ COMPANY NAME)?

Yes, Company name verified.....1 (ASK S2)

No, not verified.....2 (TERMINATE INTERVIEW)

S2. May I speak with (READ CONTACT NAME)?

Owner or other decision maker put on line..... (ASK S4)

Owner no longer available with the company..... (ASK S3)

S3. Is there someone else I can talk to who could answer some questions about the firm, including its ownership and real estate transaction deals?

Yes...(ASK S4)

No...(No, schedule callback)

S4. IF OWNER or OTHER DECISION MAKER IS PUT ON THE LINE)

Are you the owner or an authorized decision-maker in your company?

Yes...1 (CONTINUE WITH S8 AFTER READING FOLLOWING STATEMENT)

This call may be monitored for quality assurance

No, transferred to another party (Manager, etc.)..... (ASK S5)

S5. Are you able to answer questions concerning the business, including its ownership and real estate transaction deals?

Yes...(CONTINUE S7 AFTER READING FOLLOWING STATEMENT):

This call may be monitored for quality assurance.

No... (ASK S6)

S6. Is there someone else I can talk to who could answer some questions about the business, including its ownership and real estate transaction deals?

Yes...(ASK S7)

NO...(SCHEDULE A CALL-BACK)

S7. IF NEW PERSON SPEAKING WITH:

Hello, my name is _____ and I am calling on behalf of New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC). NYCEDC has retained MGT to conduct a Disparity Study on the commercial real estate industry. The overall purpose of the Disparity Study is to assess the effects of race, ethnicity, and gender on commercial real estate development firms' ability to acquire capital or bonding, and conduct real estate transactions or business deals in NYCEDC's marketplace.

We understand that this may be a difficult topic to discuss. However, your feedback is important to addressing whether discrimination exists and, if so, its affects on contracting for minority and women-owned developers in NYCEDC's marketplace. **Individual information is kept confidential to the extent permitted by law. Your firm has been selected to participate in a questionnaire to ascertain experiences of discrimination, if any, towards developers.**

If you have any questions or would like more information about the Disparity Study, please visit the study website at www.NYCEDCDisparityStudy.com or contact MGT at NYCEDCDisparityStudy@mgt.us.

Q1 1. May I please have YOUR NAME just in case we have any further questions?

Q2 Please provide a PHONE NUMBER we can reach you at if we need to follow up with you on your survey responses. **[REQUIRED]**

Q3 What is your email address? **[REQUIRED]**



Q4 What is your OFFICIAL TITLE? **[REQUIRED]**

- Owner (1)
- CEO/President (2)
- Vice President (3)
- Chief Financial Officer (4)
- Chief Operation Officer (5)
- Other (6)

Ask this question ONLY: If Q4 = 6

Q5 OFFICIAL COMPANY TITLE

Q6 Please provide the NAME of your Company/Organization. **[REQUIRED]**

Q7 What is the STRUCTURE of your firm? **[REQUIRED]**

- Corporation (1)
- General Partnership (2)
- Joint Venture (3)
- Limited Liability Corporation (4)
- Limited Liability Partnership (5)
- Limited Partnership (6)



Q8 What is your company's PRIMARY LINE OF BUSINESS? **[REQUIRED]**

- Architecture and Engineering (1)
- Construction (2)
- Other Professional Services (3)
- Development (5)
- Financing and Lending (6)
- Property Management (7)
- Other (Please specify your company's primary line of business) (4)

Ask this question ONLY if Q8 = 4

Q9 Please explain your company's Primary Line of Business.

Q10 What is your company's PRIMARY INDUSTRY? **[REQUIRED]**

- Multifamily (1)
- Office (2)
- Industrial (3)
- Retail (5)
- Mixed Use (6)
- Other (Please specify your company's primary line of business) (4)



Ask this question ONLY If Q10 = 4

Q11 Please explain your company's Primary Industry.

Q12 Does your firm work PRIMARILY as a lead developer, partner, financier, or service provider?
[REQUIRED]

- Lead Developer (1)
- Partner (2)
- Financier/Investor (3)
- Service Provider (4)
- Other (5)

Ask this question ONLY If Q12 = 5

Q13 Please explain your company's primary role.



Q14 Is at least 51 percent of your company owned, managed, and controlled by a Woman or Women? **[REQUIRED]**

Yes (1)

No (2)

Q15 Is at least 51 percent of your company owned, managed, and controlled by one of the following RACIAL or ETHNIC GROUP(S)? **[REQUIRED]**

African American or Black (1)

Asian Pacific American (2)

Asian Indian American (8)

Caucasian/White (Non-Hispanic) (3)

Hispanic American or Latino (4)

Native American (5)

Other (Please specify the race or ethnicity of the owner(s)/manager(s)) (6)

Refuse to Answer (7)

Ask this question ONLY If Q15 = 6

Q16 Specify Other: RACE OR ETHNICITY

Ask this question ONLY If Q15 = 7

Q17: The purpose of this study is to identify the impact of race, ethnicity, and gender on a firm's ability to engage in real estate transactions or deals in public and private marketplaces. Do you want to change your answer?

- Yes (1)
- Refuse to answer - exiting the survey (2)

If Q17=1, Re-Ask Q15

State ONLY If Q17 = 2

Q18 TERMINATION STATEMENT: That completes our survey. Again, thank you for your input and your participation in this important survey. Since you refused to provide your firm's ownership classification, we will end the survey. Thank you.

Q19 Between 2017 and 2023, has your company SUBMITTED BIDS, QUOTES, or PROPOSALS (attempted to do work) on real estate projects with a City of New York agency (including NYCEDC)? OR BEEN INCLUDED AS A PARTNER on real estate projects with a City of New York agency (including NYCEDC)?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)
- Not Interested in working on NYCEDC or City of New York agency transactions (3)

Skip To: Q21 ONLY If Q19 = 1

ASK this question ONLY :If Q19= 2 or 3

Q20 Why have you NOT ATTEMPTED to engage on NYCEDC or City of New York agency real estate projects?

- Unfavorable experience(s) of discriminatory behavior (1)
- Other (Please specify other reason you have not attempted to do business on NYCEDC or City of New York real estate projects) (2)
- Unsure (3)



ASK this question: If Q20 = 2 or 1

Q21 Please specify REASONS your company has not attempted to NYCEDC or City of New York agency real estate projects.

Ask this question ONLY: If Q19 = 1

Q22 Between 2017 and 2023, has your firm BEEN AWARDED a real estate deal with NYCEDC/City of New York agency or has your company WORKED ON a NYCEDC/City of New York agency real estate deal as a partner, financier, or service provider?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)
- Unsure (3)

Q23 Between 2017 and 2023, did you apply for a tax incentive program from New York City Industrial Development Agency (NYCIDA)?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

ASK this question: ONLY If Q23 = 1

Q24 Was your application accepted?

- Yes (1)
 - No (2)
-



The following questions will be asked about your or your company's experience doing business on a government or non-government contract. For the purpose of this questionnaire, the following terms are defined as follow:

- Government contract refers to an agreement (lease/purchase/sell etc.) between your firm and a City of New York agency (including NYCEDC) regardless of whether you are a lead developer, partnering entity, financier, or service provider.
- Non-Government contract refers to a contract or agreement with or on behalf of non-government entity.

Q25 Have you or your firm been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender because **there is an "informal network" of developers, financiers, or service providers that have excluded your firm from doing business, or excluded you from events, organizations, or business networks** e.g., developers always partners with firms that they have close relationships with and are of the same race, ethnicity, or gender?

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)

Q26 Have you or your company been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **in business practices such as lending discrimination by financial institutions** e.g., unfavorable lending terms for minority or women-owned businesses?

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)



Q27 Have you or your company experienced **discrimination due to your race, ethnicity, or gender with bid shopping** e.g., firms disclosing other's pricing or terms to other bidders in an attempt to obtain an even lower bid or terms that place your firm at a disadvantage?

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)

Q28 Have you or your company experienced discrimination due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **while executing your work, e.g., the use of racial slurs, workplace violence, intimidation, harassment, or sabotage?**

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)

Q29 Have you or your company been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **with double standards in measuring performance of your work** e.g., inspectors unfavorably targeting minority and women-owned businesses while not holding non-minority firms to the same standard?

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)



Q30 Have you or your company been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **with discriminatory behavior of refusal by agencies, other firms, service providers, and/or customers to deal with minorities or women, etc.?**

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)

Q31 Have you or your company been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **with discriminatory denial of the opportunity to bid** e.g., not being allowed to bid because of your race, ethnicity, or gender?

- Yes on a government contract (1)
- Yes on non-government contract (2)
- Yes on both (3)
- None of the above (4)

Ask this question ONLY if Q25, Q26, Q27, Q28, Q29, Q30, OR Q31 = 1

Q32 Your previous response(s) indicate that you or your company have experienced discriminatory treatment due to your race, ethnicity, or gender. **Please describe the situation(s) in which you or your company experienced unfavorable treatment.**



Ask this question: ONLY if Q22 = 1 OR Q28 = 1

Q33 While working on a Government contract, have you experienced a situation where Government PROJECT STAFF WAS UNWILLING TO DEAL WITH MINORITIES OR WOMEN?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

Ask this question: If Q33 = 1

Q34 Please describe the situation.

Q35 Does your company have BONDING for the type of work you bid on?

- Yes (1)
- No-Our line of work does not require bonding (2)

Skip To: Q29 If Q35 = 2

Q36 Have you or your company been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender with discriminatory denial of acquiring a bond?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

Ask this question ONLY If Q37 = 1

Q37 Please describe the situation.



Q38 What is your current AGGREGATE (MAXIMUM) BONDING CAPACITY?

- Up to \$500,000 (1)
- \$500,001 to \$1 million (2)
- \$1,000,001 to \$5 million (3)
- \$5,000,001 to \$10 million (4)
- \$10,000,001 to \$100 million (5)
- \$100,000,001 to \$500 million (6)
- \$500,000,001 or more (7)
- Unsure (9)

Q39 Between 2017 and 2023 has your company applied for a LOAN or BUSINESS CREDIT?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

Skip To: Q46 If Q39 = 2

Q40 Was your LOAN or CREDIT APPLICATION completely or partially DENIED?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

Skip To: Q46 If Q40 = 2



Q41 Do you think your LOAN or CREDIT APPLICATION was completely or partially DENIED because of your race, ethnicity, or gender?

Yes (1)

No (2)

Unsure (3)

Skip To: Q43 If Q41 = 2 OR 3

Q42 From the LOAN or CREDIT APPLICATION, were you only approved for a partial amount of what was requested?

Yes (1)

No (2)

Ask this question ONLY If Q42 = 1

Q43 Do you think you were only approved for a partial amount of what was requested because of your race, ethnicity, or gender?

Yes (1)

No (2)

Unsure (3)

Skip To: Q45 If Q43 = 3

ASK this question ONLY If Q41 Or Q43 = 1

Q44 Please describe the situation in which your race, ethnicity, or gender influenced the DENIAL OR PARTIAL ACCEPTANCE of your LOAN OR CREDIT APPLICATION.

Q45 Specify Other: REASON WHY YOU THOUGHT YOUR LOAN MIGHT BE DENIED OR PARTIALLY GRANTED



Ask this question ONLY If Q12 = 2 Or 4

Q46 Do COMPANIES who contract with your company on public sector or government projects with M/WBE PROJECT GOALS also solicit your company on projects (private or public) WITHOUT M/WBE PROJECT GOALS?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

Ask this question ONLY: Q12 = 1

Q47 As a LEAD DEVELOPER, do you SOLICIT PARTNERSHIP from MINORITY-OWNED or WOMEN-OWNED BUSINESS ENTERPRISES on real estate projects without M/WBE goals?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)
- Not Applicable (3)

Q48 Have you experienced or observed a situation in which a lead developer INCLUDE MINORITY-OWNED or WOMEN-OWNED developers or service providers on a bid or proposal (to satisfy the "good faith effort" requirements) and then DROPS and/or REPLACES the firm after winning the award for no legitimate reason?

- Yes (1)
- No (2)

Skip To: Q50 If Q48 = 2

Ask this question ONLY: If Q48 = 1

Q49 Please describe the situation.



Q50 Between 2017 and 2023 what was the average NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES on your company's payroll, including full-time and part-time staff?

- None (1)
- 1-20 employees (2)
- 21-50 employees (3)
- 51-75 employees (4)
- 76-100 employees (5)
- 101-300 employees (6)
- 301-500 employees (7)
- 500+ employees (8)



Q51 Between 2017 and 2023 what was the average annual revenue of the company?

- Up to \$500,000 (1)
- \$500,001 to \$1 million (2)
- \$1,000,001 to \$10 million (3)
- \$10,000,001 to \$30 million (4)
- \$30,000,001 to \$100 million (5)
- \$100,000,001 to \$500 million (6)
- \$500,000,001 to \$1 billion (7)
- More than \$1 billion (8)

Q52 Do you have any additional FEEDBACK or INFORMATION that you would like to share regarding how race, ethnicity, or gender may have affected your company, while working on NYCEDC/City of New York agency real estate projects, working with lead developers/financiers/service providers, or working with partners? PLEASE BE SPECIFIC. IF YOU DO NOT HAVE ANY FEEDBACK, ENTER 'NONE.'



Appendix E In-Depth Interview Guide for Firms

Phase 1 Telephone Introduction

Hello, my name is _____ and I am calling on behalf of the New York City Economic Development Corporation to speak with developers that engaged in real estate transactions or business deals with the City of New York or within New York City.

Is this _____ (firm's name)? IF THE FIRM NAME IS VERIFIED, CONTINUE.

Are you the owner or an authorized decision-maker in your firm? [IF NO] May I speak with that person? [IF NO, SCHEDULE CALL-BACK]?

IF TRANSFERRED TO ANOTHER PARTY (CFO, MANAGER, ETC): READ INTRO AGAIN then ask: Can you answer questions concerning this firm's business experiences? IF YES, CONTINUE.

The New York City Economic Development Corporation has commissioned MGT Consulting to conduct a disparity study on the effects of race, ethnicity, and gender on commercial real estate development firms' ability to acquire capital or bonding, and conduct real estate transactions or business deals within New York City.

Gathering feedback and input from firms is one of the most important elements of this study. The results of the study will provide guidance regarding any potential changes to NYC EDC's M/WBE program.

The interview will last approximately 45 minutes.

When can we schedule your interview to receive your input and recommendations on doing business on City projects or contracts?

Pre-Interview Questions via Qualtrics – Firms that agree to participate in an interview will be provided with a link to complete pre-interview questions. The pre-interview will provide clarity and focus on specific questions for the interviewee. The Qualtrics link is available here: https://mgtamer.co1.qualtrics.com/jfe/form/SV_bvdlxZ7yW1mnq4e



Survey Introduction

The New York City Economic Development Corporation has commissioned MGT Consulting to conduct a disparity study on the effects of race, ethnicity, and gender on commercial real estate development firms' ability to acquire capital or bonding, and conduct real estate transactions or business deals within New York City. The purpose of this pre-interview questionnaire is to learn more about your firm and streamline the interview questions. Your responses will be aggregated for the overall analysis. Individual information is kept confidential to the extent permitted by law.

Your firm has been selected to participate in an interview to learn more about your experiences engaging in real estate transactions with the City and/or within the private sector.

The survey and subsequent interview should be completed by the firm's Owner, CEO, President, Vice President, or other decision-making authority with in-depth knowledge of the firm and its experience in the marketplace. Questions are related to firm ownership, barriers in contracting, and experience in conducting business in the NYCEDC's market.

The survey can be completed in 15 minutes or less.

1. Please provide Firm Name

a. _____

2. What is your title?

- a. Owner
- b. CEO/President
- c. Vice President
- d. Chief Financial Officer
- e. Chief Operations Officer
- f. Other (What is your official title?)

3. Specify Other title

a. _____

4. Please provide your name.

a. _____

5. Please provide your email address.

a. _____

6. Please provide a phone number we can reach you at to follow up with you on your survey responses and conduct the interview.

a. _____

7. What is the structure of your firm?

- a. Corporation
- b. General Partnership
- c. Joint Venture



- d. Limited Liability Corporation
 - e. Limited Liability Partnership
 - f. Limited Partnership
8. Is at least **51 percent** of your firm owned, managed, and controlled by a woman or women?
- a. Yes
 - b. No
9. Is at least **51 percent** of your firm owned, managed, and controlled by a person or people of one of the following racial or ethnic group(s)?
- a. African American
 - b. Asian-Pacific American
 - c. Asian-Indian American
 - d. Caucasian/White (non-Hispanic)
 - e. Hispanic American or Latino
 - f. Native American
10. Other - (Please specify the race or ethnicity of the owner(s)/manager(s):
- a. _____
11. What is the highest level of education completed by the primary owner of your firm?
- a. Some high school
 - b. High school graduate
 - c. Trade or technical education
 - d. Associate Degree (AA, AS, etc.)
 - e. Bachelor's Degree (BA, BS, etc.)
 - f. Graduate or Professional Degree (MA, PhD, JD, etc.)
 - g. Don't know
12. What is your firm's primary line of business?
- a. Architecture and Engineering
 - b. Construction
 - c. Other Professional Services
 - d. Development
 - e. Financing and Lending
 - f. Property Management
13. Other, please explain your firm's primary line of business.
- a. _____
14. What is your firm's primary industry?
- a. Multifamily
 - b. Office
 - c. Industrial
 - d. Retail
 - e. Mixed Use
15. Other, please explain your firm's primary industry.



a. _____

16. What is the age of the firm?

- a. 0-2 years
- b. 3-5 years
- c. 6-10 years
- d. 11-15 years
- e. 16-20 years
- f. 21+ years

17. What is the average annual revenue of the firm?

- a. Up to \$500,000
- b. \$500,001 to \$1 Million
- c. \$1,000,001 to \$5 Million
- d. \$5,000,001 to \$10 Million
- e. \$10,000,001 to \$30 Million
- f. \$30,000,001 to \$100 Million
- g. \$100,000,001 to \$500 Million
- h. \$500,000,001 to \$1 billion
- i. More than \$1 billion

18. What is your current aggregate (total) bonding capacity?

- a. Up to \$500,000
- b. \$500,001 to \$1 Million
- c. \$1,000,001 to \$5 Million
- d. \$5,000,001 to \$10 Million
- e. \$10,000,001 to \$100 Million
- f. \$100,000,001 to \$500 Million
- g. \$500,000,001 or more
- h. Don't Know
- i. Refuse to answer

19. Does your firm work primarily as a lead developer, partner, financier, or service provider?

- a. A lead developer
- b. A partner
- c. A financier/investor
- d. Other service provider
- e. Not applicable

20. Between 2017 and 2023, has your firm engaged in real estate transactions within New York City?

- a. Yes – with NYCEDC or another City of New York agency
- b. Yes – but not with NYCEDC or other City of New York government entity
- c. No



21. Between 2017 and 2023, did you apply for a tax incentive program from New York City Industrial Development Agency (NYCIDA)?
- a. Yes
 - b. No

22. Was your application accepted?
- a. Yes
 - b. No

The following questions will be asked about your or your firm’s experience conducting business on government or non-government real estate transactions. For the purpose of this questionnaire, the following terms are defined as follow:

- **Government contract** refers to an agreement (lease/purchase/sell etc.) between your firm and a City of New York entity regardless of whether you are a lead developer, partnering entity, or service provider.
- **Non-Government contract** refers to a contract or agreement with or on behalf of non-government entity.

23. Have you or your firm been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender because **there is an “informal network” of developers, financiers, or service providers that have excluded your firm from doing business, or excluded you from events, organizations, or business networks** e.g., developers always partners with firms that they have close relationships with and are of the same race, ethnicity, or gender?

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1
- Yes on a non-government contract .. 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4

24. Have you or your firm been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **in business practices such as lending discrimination by financial institutions** e.g., unfavorable lending terms for minority or women-owned firms?

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1
- Yes on a non-government contract .. 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4



25. Have you or your firm experienced **discrimination due to your race, ethnicity, or gender with bid shopping** e.g., firms disclosing other's pricing or terms to other bidders in an attempt to obtain an even lower bid?

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1
- Yes on a non-government contract ... 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4

26. Have you or your firm experienced discrimination due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **while executing your work, e.g., the use of racial slurs, workplace violence, intimidation, harassment, or sabotage?**

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1
- Yes on a non-government contract ... 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4

27. Have you or your firm been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **with double standards in measuring performance, or during inspections of your work** e.g., inspectors unfavorably targeting minority and women-owned firms while not holding non-minority firms to the same standard?

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1
- Yes on a non-government contract 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4

28. Have you or your firm been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **with discriminatory behavior of refusal by agencies, other firms, service providers, and/or customers to deal with minorities or women, etc.?**

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1



- Yes on a non-government contract ... 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4

29. Have you or your firm been treated unfavorably due to your race, ethnicity, or gender **with discriminatory denial of the opportunity to bid** e.g., not being allowed to bid because of your race, ethnicity, or gender?

[REQUEST ANSWER]

- Yes on a government contract 1
- Yes on a non-government contract ... 2
- Yes on both 3
- None of the above 4

Thank you. We look forward to speaking with you during your interview.



DAY OF IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW

Introduction

Thank you for agreeing to participate. Your input is very important to the outcome of the Disparity Study. Your responses to this interview will be aggregated for the overall analysis and used only for this research study. Individual information or identifying characteristics of your firm will not be published.

If you have any questions regarding the disparity study or this interview, I will be happy to provide you with additional contact information at the end of the interview.

By participating in this interview, you acknowledge that:

The opinions and perceptions you will provide are given freely and represent an accurate reflection of your experience doing business or attempting to do business with the City of New York.

- You have not been coerced or received any remuneration for your comments.
- You understand that neither your name nor your firm's name will be published in the report.
- Your participation in this interview has no direct benefit to your firm or to MGT.

Thank you for your participation!

In-Depth Interview Questionnaire

1. First, please tell me about your firm. Tell me about the type of work you do, etc.
2. Can you share your personal journey and experience within the commercial real estate market within New York City?
 - a. *What barriers are prevalent when trying to enter or expand in the commercial real estate market? hat barriers did you specifically face?*
 - b. *How have you navigated challenges related to race, ethnicity, or other demographic factors in your career?*
3. Tell me about your experience bidding on City commercial real estate projects.
 - a. *Have you experienced discrimination when trying to work or working on New York City contracts? PROBE: If yes, please tell me about what happened and by whom. NOTE: Reassure participant of confidentiality.*
 - b. *Have you won?*
 - c. *If not, why do you think you were not awarded the project?*
 - d. *Do you feel it was due to race/ethnicity/gender?*
4. Did you experience discrimination while you were working on a project or contract?



- a. *If so, please tell me what happened.*
5. Tell me about your experience applying for development subsidies for City commercial real estate projects.
 - a. *What challenges or barriers have you encountered when seeking development subsidies?*
 - b. *Were you approved? Did you receive the full amount requested?*
 - c. *If you were not approved, why do you think that is? Was it due to discrimination based on race/ethnicity/gender?*
 - d.
6. Can you describe your experiences with securing financing for commercial real estate projects?
 - a. *If you applied for a loan, why did you?*
 - b. *Were you approved? Did you receive the full amount requested?*
 - c. *If you were not approved, why do you think that is? Was it due to discrimination based on race/ethnicity/gender?*
7. How easy or difficult is it for minority or women-owned businesses to secure financing for commercial real estate projects in New York City?
 - a. *What are the specific barriers or challenges in the financing process that disproportionately affect minority and women-owned businesses?*
8. Have you experienced discrimination when bidding, or attempting to engage in real estate transactions, with other public entities or agencies?
 - a. *If yes, please explain what happened.*
 - b. *Explain the extent of discrimination experienced and the impact it had on you.*
 - c. *Please also describe the types of individuals who caused the discrimination – for instance, were they employees of a potential business partner? A service provider? Individuals involved in bonding or financing?*
 - d. *Do you believe your experience was due to your race, ethnicity, or gender?*
9. In your industry, do you believe there is an “*informal network*” of individuals, other development firms, or service providers that make it more difficult for you to conduct business or obtain financing?
 - a. *If yes, please give examples of how this occurs.*
10. Have you experienced discrimination when bidding, trying to work, or working on private (non-government) projects?
 - a. *If yes, please explain what happened.*
 - b. *Explain the extent of discrimination experienced and the impact it had on you.*



- c. *Please also describe the types of individuals who caused the discrimination – for instance, were they NYC EDC employees? Employees of a potential business partner? A service provider? Individuals involved in bonding or financing?*
- d. *Do you believe your experience was due to your race, ethnicity, or gender?*

FOR LEAD DEVELOPERS:

11. How do you hire and/or engage in business deals with firms on projects without MWBE goals?

FOR PARTNERING FIRMS/SERVICE PROVIDERS:

12. Do lead developers who solicit bids/qualifications from you on their public projects also solicit bids from you for their private contract work?
 - a. *If no, why do you think that is?*

FOR ALL PARTICIPANTS:

13. What best practices have you observed in the industry that promote fair and equitable access to commercial real estate?
14. Can you suggest any improvements or new initiatives that could enhance diversity and inclusion in this sector?

This concludes the interview. On behalf of the New York City Economic Development Corporation, thank you for your participation.

If you have any questions or would like more information about the Disparity study, please contact us via email at NYCEDCDisparityStudy@mgtconsulting.com or visit www.NYCEDCDisparityStudy.com.

Appendix F In-Depth Interview Guide for Professional Organizations

TELEPHONE INTRODUCTION

Hello, my name is ____ and I am calling on behalf of the New York City Economic Development Corporation to gather input from area trade associations, chambers of commerce, and business organizations concerning the business climate in NYC EDC’s marketplace regarding minority- and women-owned commercial real estate development firms. MGT Consulting is conducting a disparity study on the effects of race, ethnicity, and gender on commercial real estate development firms’ ability to acquire capital or bonding, and conduct real estate transactions or business deals within New York City. It is also important to include information from the local professional organizations that serve the commercial real estate community.

Your organization has been selected to participate in an in-depth interview to share information about 1) services you provide to your members or the general commercial real estate community, 2) your relationship or interactions with NYC EDC, 3) issues or concerns held by your organization or your members regarding conducting businesses with NYC EDC or other public and private entities, and 4) suggested recommendations to enhance NYC EDC’s procurement process to include outreach and contracting with MWBE developer firms.

I’d like to schedule a date and time to talk with you to conduct this very important interview. The meeting should last about an hour. When can we schedule your interview?

Name of Organization: _____	Industry Type: _____
Date of Confirmation Call: _____	Interview Date: _____

Thank you for scheduling time to provide your input on this very important study. To learn more about the NYC EDC’s disparity study, we invite you to visit www.nycedcdisparitystudy.com.



DAY OF IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW

Date of Interview _____

Interviewer's Name _____

Interviewee Information	
Organization Name	
Interviewee Name	
Interviewee Title	
Interviewee Phone #	
Interviewee Email	
Type of Organization	

IN-DEPTH INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

1. Please describe your organization's mission and strategic objectives.
2. Please describe the composition of your membership:
 - a. Firm ownership makeup
 - b. Business size of members
 - c. Members engaged in public procurement
3. Can you provide an overview of the typical experiences your members encounter when conducting (or attempting to conduct) real estate transactions or business deals?
Probe: What are the common challenges or obstacles that your members face in the real estate industry?
4. Do your members feel they have equal access to opportunities in the real estate market, regardless of their background?
Probe: Have there been instances where your members felt they were unfairly excluded from certain deals or opportunities?
5. Do your members feel they have equal access to resources, such as financing, information, or networking opportunities?
Probe: Have there been instances where your members faced challenges accessing resources compared to others in the industry?
6. How do your members perceive their treatment by other stakeholders in real estate transactions, such as lenders, agents, or property owners?
Probe: Have there been instances where your members felt they were treated differently due to their race, ethnicity, or gender?
7. From your perspective, how effective are existing policies and regulations in addressing discrimination within the real estate sector?
 - a. Are there any specific policy recommendations your organization supports to address disparities in the industry?
8. Would you recommend any of your members we should speak with directly, regarding their experiences conducting (or attempting to conduct) real estate transactions or business deals with NYCEDC?



9. Are there any other issues that you think are important for the study to address?
 - a. Why is the issue significant?

On behalf of the New York City Economic Development Corporation, thank you for participating in this interview.

If you have any questions or would like more information about the Disparity study, please contact us via email at NYCEDCDisparityStudy@mgtconsulting.com or visit www.nycedcdisparitystudy.com.