

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING
OF
THE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF
NEW YORK CITY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY

April 5, 2018

A special meeting of the Audit Committee of the Board of Directors (the “Committee”) of New York City Industrial Development Agency (“NYCIDA” or the “Agency”) was held on Thursday, April 5, 2018, called at the direction of the President, at the New York City Economic Development Corporation (“NYCEDC”), 110 William Street, Conference Room 5B, New York, New York 10038.

The following members of the Committee were present in person or by means of a conference call at the above indicated meeting of the Committee (the “Meeting”), constituting a quorum:

- Albert V. De Leon, Committee Chairperson (present in person)
- Kevin Doyle (attended by phone)
- Shanel Thomas (present in person)

In addition, the following members of NYCEDC staff were present:

- Finance: Kim Vaccari - CFO, Spencer Hobson – EVP/Treasurer, Raafat Osman – Assistant Treasurer
- Internal Audit (“IA”): David Price – SVP, Anjanette Ortiz – VP
- Compliance Department (“Compliance”): Shin Mitsugi – SVP
- Strategic Investments Group (“SIG”): Anne Shutkin – VP

Mr. De Leon called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Mr. Osman, the Assistant Treasurer, stated that NYCIDA is seeking to enter into a contract (“Audit Contract”) with Ernst & Young LLP (“E&Y”) to provide audit services for the Fiscal Years ending June 30, 2018 through 2021. A Request for Proposals (“RFP”) was issued to engage an independent auditor (“the Auditor”) to provide the services. The RFP was delivered to eighty-one (81) audit firms selected from the City Comptroller’s pre-qualified certified public accountant list and was advertised in the City Record. A selection committee of NYCEDC staff (representatives from Finance, Internal Audit and Compliance) evaluated the proposals and ranked the firms.

Mr. Osman further stated that the evaluations considered each firm’s experience in providing audit services to similar entities, the audit methodology, composition and relative experience of the audit team, the firm’s proposed fees, and the overall quality of the proposal. At the conclusion of the process, E&Y received the highest ranking and was determined to be the strongest firm for the award of the Audit Contract.

Mr. De Leon and Mr. Doyle questioned the criteria and diversity that made E&Y the selection committee’s highest-ranked audit firm. The selection committee all agreed that the depth of experience, subject matter expertise, #1 diversity classification and understanding of NYCIDA and Build NYC’s complicated business structures made E&Y the strongest firm for the award of the Audit Contract.

With no other questions or comments, Mr. Doyle motioned to approve the Management’s recommendation for External Auditors, selected via RFP for submission for approval by the Agency’s Board of Directors. Ms. Thomas seconded the motion and the motion was approved.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:25 a.m.