

**APPLE INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT CORP.:**  
**THE ACQUISITION AND DISPOSITION OF REAL PROPERTY**  
**November 2013**

**I. Introduction**

In accordance with the requirements of Title 5-A of Article 9 and Section 2824(1)(e) of the Public Authorities Law, added to such law by the Public Authorities Accountability Act of 2005 (“PAAA”), as amended, the following comprehensive guidelines (“Guidelines”) set forth the Apple Industrial Development Corp. (“Apple”) (i) operative policy and instructions regarding the use, awarding, monitoring and reporting of contracts for the disposal of property through means of real property sale, ground lease, space lease and roof top lease, (ii) guidelines relating to the acquisition of real property, and (iii) related policies and procedures.

**II. Methods of disposing of real property**

Apple shall dispose of real property in accordance with Title 5-A and other applicable laws in a manner so as to permit such full and free competition as is appropriate under the circumstances and shall award contracts to parties offering the most advantageous terms, financial and/or otherwise. All dispositions of real property shall further comply with such requirements as may from this time be imposed by the City. The Contracting Officer for real property dispositions, appointed by Apple’s Board of Directors, shall supervise and direct all dispositions of Apple real property. The real property may be disposed of for not less than fair market value for cash, credit, or other property, with or without warranty, upon such terms and conditions as the Contracting Officer or his/her designee deems proper, except as otherwise permitted herein. No disposition of real property shall be made unless an appraisal has been made by an independent appraiser and included in the Apple file. To the extent reasonably feasible, the appraisal for sales and ground leases shall be dated within twelve months of the date on which Apple enters into a contract to dispose of the real property. The independent appraiser must be a New York State Certified General Real Estate Appraiser and may not be an entity owned or controlled by the City, Apple or the prospective purchaser or lessee or any of their affiliates. An appraisal meeting the foregoing requirements is a “Conforming Appraisal”. To the extent feasible, before approving the disposal of any real property the Board shall be advised of the date of the Conforming Appraisal.

Under the Contracting Officer’s or his/her designee’s direction, Apple primarily shall use two methods of disposition: Request for Proposals (“RFP”) and negotiated disposition.

**RFPs**

***Real Property Sales and Ground Leases***

The RFP process is a process whereby the development community and other entities and individuals are invited to submit proposals for one or more properties. In an effort to create full and free competition consistent with the value and nature of the property, RFPs will be advertised in the City Record and shall be advertised through the internet and in local newspapers, including community based newspapers, in multi-language publications and/or in trade publications, where appropriate given the nature of the property. In addition, RFPs shall be posted on Apple’s web-site, if any, and, on occasion, will be distributed to a direct mailing list.

All advertisements shall list when and where proposals shall be disclosed, except that if the disposition falls within one of the criteria for a negotiated disposition described below, at the discretion of the Contracting Officer, the advertisement may omit such disclosure information and/or the disclosure may or may not be made. The Contracting Officer shall approve the location of all advertisements and postings and any omission of disclosure information.

RFPs for real property sales and ground leases may, but are not required to, include an introduction and sections on development strategy, objectives, disposition process, public review process, general conditions and, where appropriate, economic development benefits. All RFPs for real property sales and ground leases must include a site description, proposal requirements and selection criteria.

Although the selection criteria for each RFP varies, as appropriate, Apple will include, where appropriate, at least the following selection criteria in reviewing submissions and selecting a proposal:

- *Economic Impact on / Spending in New York City* - projected expenditures, including purchase price, construction costs and annual operating costs; projected temporary (construction) and permanent on-site employment and payroll; projected applicable New York City taxes such as real property, sales and personal income taxes, and the extent, if any, to which the proposed project will create additional sources of revenue to the City.
- *Development Team Qualifications* – experience and development skills to complete the proposed project on time and within budget, for which experience in completing projects of a similar nature and scope as is contemplated by the RFP shall be taken into account.
- *Financial Viability* – developer’s financial means to complete the project, availability of funding sources to finance the project, and sufficient use to support operating expenses, capital costs and any debt service.
- *Integration into Surrounding Community* – environmental issues such as pedestrian access, vehicular access and circulation, building mass, parking availability, landscaping and overall integration into surrounding community.
- *Design* – architectural design, urban design, environmental development techniques, and compliance with applicable zoning, environmental and other regulatory controls.
- *MWBE Participation* – participation by minority-owned and women-owned businesses.
- *Purpose* – whether the project involves an industry or activity which the City seeks to retain and foster and conforms with Apple’s mission.

Depending on the nature of the real property, RFPs may include additional selection criteria deemed appropriate by the Contracting Officer or Apple’s President.

With regard to an RFP for a real property sale or ground lease, Apple shall notify the City Council Member and Community Board whose districts include the property, that an RFP is being issued.

The contract will be awarded to the candidate presenting the most advantageous terms, price and other factors considered in connection with the criteria enumerated in the RFP. Apple may reject the proposals when the minimum terms and conditions have not been met, competition is

insufficient and/or it is in the public interest to do so. The award/designation will be made by notice within a reasonable time of the original advertisement, all circumstances considered.

### ***Space Leases and Rooftop Leases***

As with real property sales and ground leases, in an effort to create full and free competition consistent with the value and nature of the property, available space will be offered for lease to the public through an RFP advertised in the City Record and may also be offered for lease to the public through an RFP advertised in appropriate local newspapers and/or appropriate trade publications, depending on the nature of the property. In addition, RFPs may be posted on Apple's web-site, if any, and, on occasion, will be distributed to a direct mailing list. All advertisements shall list when and where proposals shall be disclosed, except that if the disposition falls within one of the criteria for a negotiated disposition described below, at the discretion of the Contracting Officer or his/her designee, the advertisement may omit such disclosure information and/or the disclosure may or may not be made.

Although the selection criteria for each RFP varies, as appropriate, Apple may use selection criteria such as the following in reviewing submissions and selecting a proposal:

- conforming zoning use
- compliance with Apple policy
- candidate's economic viability
- amount of space to be leased
- term of the lease
- number of jobs to be provided
- projected investment in permanent improvements
- projected impact on economic development, public health, safety, welfare and benefit to the City
- financial return for the life of the lease.

Depending on the nature of the real property, RFPs may or may not include all of the above and may include additional selection criteria.

The contract will be awarded to the candidate presenting the most advantageous terms, price and other factors considered. Apple may reject the proposals when the minimum terms and conditions have not been met, competition is insufficient and/or it is in the public interest to do so. The award/designation will be made by notice within a reasonable time of the original advertisement, all circumstances considered.

### **Negotiated Disposition**

#### ***Real Property Sales, Ground Leases, Space Leases and Rooftop Leases***

RFP by advertisement is not always the most appropriate and effective means of disposal of real property. In certain instances, including when the disposition is for less than fair market value but the purpose of the disposition is within Apple's purpose, mission or governing statute or the disposition is otherwise authorized by law, Title 5-A permits a negotiated disposition subject to obtaining such competition as is feasible under the circumstances. In some circumstances, the

disposition will involve a sole source disposition. Title 5-A, Sections 2897 (6)(c)(ii)-(vi) and 2897(7) set forth that real property may be disposed of through a negotiated disposition when:

- (ii) the fair market value of the property does not exceed fifteen thousand dollars;
- (iii) bid prices after advertising therefor are not reasonable, either as to all or some part of the property, or have not been independently arrived at in open competition;
- (iv) the disposal will be to the state or any political subdivision, and the estimated fair market value of the property and other satisfactory terms of disposal are obtained by negotiation;
- (v) the disposal is for an amount less than the fair market value of the property, and (a) the transferee is a government or other public entity, and the terms and conditions of the transfer require that the ownership and use of the asset will remain with the government or any other public entity; (b) the purpose of the transfer is within the purpose, mission or governing statute of Apple; or (c) in the event Apple seeks to transfer an asset for less than its fair market value to other than a governmental entity, which disposal would not be consistent with Apple's mission, purpose or governing statutes. Apple shall provide written notification thereof to the governor, the speaker of the state assembly, and the temporary president of the state senate, and such proposed transfer shall be subject to denial by the governor, the state senate, or the state assembly in the manner specified in Section 2897(7)(iii): provided, however, that with respect to a below market transfer by Apple that is not within the purpose, mission or governing statute of Apple, if the governing statute provides for the approval of such transfer by the executive and legislative branches of the political subdivision in which Apple resides, and the transfer is of property obtained by Apple from that political subdivision, then such approval shall be sufficient to permit the transfer; or
- (vi) such action is otherwise authorized by law.

Item (vi) includes, without limitation, sales and leases of real property where the property has been acquired for purposes of disposal under Section 384(b)(4) of the New York City Charter, Section 1411 of the New York State Not-for-Profit Corporation Law or Section 1301(2)(g) of the New York City Charter.

If an RFP involves a disposition that meets one of the criteria described above for a negotiated disposition, the Contracting Officer or his/her designee may direct that the disposition of the real property be considered a negotiated disposition. In such circumstance, a public disclosure of the proposals would not be necessary unless otherwise required but an explanatory statement and 90 days notice (or such other period as the statute may be amended to require) would be required as detailed below.

Upon meeting Title 5-A's requirements for a negotiated disposition, the decision to proceed with a negotiated disposition in a situation where an RFP will not be used is based on an analysis of the facts and nature of the project. In such instance, a negotiated disposition may be undertaken without limitation under the following circumstances where appropriate:

- risk of business relocation or expansion outside the City , based upon a written assessment of such risks
- to permit expansion of business in the City
- due to number of jobs to be created or retained
- development of sites which lack private sector interest (as demonstrated by a failed RFP or other competitive means within the past two years)
- proximity of real property to a business' existing location
- to permit a person or entity contemplating the purchase or long term lease of City real property through Apple or New York City Economic Development Corporation to lease the property for purposes of investigations and/or work to be undertaken prior to the purchase or long term lease, or
- other important public purpose.

Regardless of the reason the negotiated disposition is deemed permissible, such competition as is “feasible” under the circumstances is still required. In some instances where advertisement is not used, Apple might notify neighboring businesses of an available parcel to give them the opportunity to submit a proposal, thereby effecting competition. However, in other instances, even such notification might not be feasible. Realistically, in certain situations a sole source disposition or little competition will be the only feasible alternative. In such instances, a negotiated disposition would be permissible pursuant to Title 5-A Section 2897(6)(c)(vi) in conjunction with Sections 1301(2)(g) and/or 384 (b)(4) of the New York City Charter or other statutory provisions and pursuant to Title 5-A Section 2897 (6)(c)(v). In cases where a sole source disposition is presented to Apple’s Board of Directors for approval, the Board should be informed of the justification for doing a sole source.

If a negotiated disposition is undertaken, in accordance with Section 2897(d) of the Public Authorities Law in most cases not less than 90 days (or such other period as the statute may later require) prior to the disposal of the property, an explanatory statement must be submitted to the state comptroller, state director of the budget, state commissioner of general services and state legislature, a copy of the same to be maintained in Apple’s files.

### **Below Fair Market Value Dispositions**

In the event a below fair market value asset transfer (pursuant to an RFP or Negotiated Disposition) is proposed to Apple’s Board of Directors, the following information must be provided to Apple’s Board of Directors and the public:

- (i) a full description of the asset;
- (ii) a Conforming Appraisal of fair market value and any other information establishing the fair market value sought by the Board;
- (iii) a description of the purpose of the transfer, and a reasonable statement of the kind and amount of the benefit to the public resulting from the transfer, including but not limited to the kind, number, location, wages or salaries of jobs created or preserved as required by the transfer, the benefits, if any, to the communities in which the asset is situated as are required by the transfer;
- (iv) a statement of the value to be received compared to the fair market value;
- (v) the names of any private parties participating in the transfer, and if different than the statement required by subparagraph (iv) of this paragraph, a statement of the value to the private party; and

- (vi) the names of other private parties who have made an offer for such asset, the value offered, and the purpose for which the asset was sought to be used.

Before approving the disposal of any property for less than fair market value, the Board of Directors of Apple shall consider the information described in the above paragraph and make a written determination that there is no reasonable alternative to the proposed below-market transfer that would achieve the same purpose of such transfer. The Contracting Officer shall provide such supplemental information as the Board may require.

### **III. Acquisitions**

Real property may be purchased by Apple for purposes of use, resale, leasing or otherwise permitting the use of the property or space therein, and may be leased by Apple for purposes of use, subleasing or assignment of lease or otherwise permitting the use of the leased property or space. The purpose of such acquisition shall be to further a purpose of Apple under Section 1411 of the New York State Not-for-Profit Corporation Law. Except for acquisitions arising out of the enforcement of remedies (including rights of reacquisition), the following requirements shall apply to acquisitions by Apple. The Contracting Officer or his/her designee shall approve the terms of the acquisition and have the approval of Apple's Board of Directors for the same.

In Apple's consideration of the acquisitions of real property, for the reasons enumerated above, the following information must be provided to the Board.

1. a description of the real property;
2. any information establishing fair market value as may be sought by the Board;
3. a description of the purpose of the acquisition, and a reasonable statement of the kind and amount of the benefit to the public resulting from such acquisition, such as the kind, number, location, wages, or salaries of jobs created or preserved as required by the acquisition, the benefits, if any, to the communities in which the property is situated as are required by the acquisition;
4. a statement of the acquisition costs;
5. the names of any private parties participating in the acquisition; and
6. any known environmental issues.

### **IV. Approvals**

All purchases, sales and leases of real property by Apple (except for those arising out of the enforcement of remedies, including exercises of rights of reacquisition) must be approved by its Board of Directors. Approvals may be obtained for specific purchases, sales or leases or the Board of Directors may grant approval to purchases, sales or leases so long as specified guidelines are met.

When City property is being leased or purchased by Apple, all City required approvals must also be obtained, e.g., ULURP approvals (Section 197-c of the New York City Charter) and Borough Board and Mayoral approvals under Section 384(b)(4) of the New York City Charter.

### **V. Monitoring and Reporting Contracts for Disposal**

Prior to the disposal of the real property, the project manager involved in the disposition shall be the primary person responsible for the monitoring of compliance with the terms of the contract or

other agreement or memorandum for the disposal and shall keep the Contracting Officer or his/her designee informed of all major issues that arise and of the status of the disposition.

The Contracting Officer shall cause a record to be maintained of all real property disposed of and shall cause to be prepared and transmitted all reports relating to the disposition of real property required by Title 5-A.

## **VI. Contracting Officer**

The Executive Vice President who oversees the Asset Management division of New York City Economic Development Corporation shall be Apple's Contracting Officer for real property dispositions.