



**Climate Innovation Hub RFP
Questions & Answers Round 2
June 6, 2024**

In connection with the **Request for Proposals** relating to the **Climate Innovation Hub** released by NYCEDC on **March 18, 2024**, the questions from Potential Respondents and answers provided by NYCEDC are below.

Programmatic Questions

Q: Could you please provide more information around how the current Pilots at BAT program is operated:

- **Who operates it?**
- **How many FTEs are needed to operate it?**
- **For the current technologies piloted at BAT, did it require infrastructure upgrade/investment and construction work? If so, how much, approximately?**
- **How is it currently funded?**
- **Do the companies selected to deploy their technologies pay a fee?**

A: Responses to each question are as follows:

- *NYCEDC currently self-operates Pilots at BAT.*
- *Approximately 1.5 FTE NYCEDC employees currently operate the program. Additional assistance from BAT's Operations and Facilities team are utilized as needed.*
- *No pilots to date have required upgrades or prior construction work, but EDC is open to and anticipates that pilots may require prerequisite upgrades or construction work in the future to allow for onsite feasibility.*
- *NYCEDC self-funds the program's operations and provides access to free piloting space at BAT. No other funds are currently exchanged.*
- *Companies piloting at BAT currently do not have to pay a fee to deploy their technologies, though they do finance their own pilots.*

Q: What are the timeline goals for self-sustaining operations?

A: The expectation is that Operators will have a self-sustaining operating model from the time of lease execution. NYCEDC is not offering operating support, so proposals must include all required resources to launch program operations. Support for start-up operational costs associated with the period of time between selection and opening of the Hub may be considered.

There are not yet defined goals. Respondents should include a timeline as part of their proposals in the 'Ongoing Operations & Management Plan'.

Q: Can we do interim programming between response and launch?

A: The Chosen Respondent is expected to begin activating spaces at BAT with Hub-related activities (as described in Section IV) as soon as feasibly possible before the full fit-out of the Hub is complete. Respondents must propose a set of potential programmatic activities and activation timelines in the 'Proposal Summary' and 'Ongoing Operations and Management Plan' as outlined in Section VI. There will be space available in 2025 for these programmatic activations on the ground and fourth floors of Building A. NYCEDC will work with the Chosen Respondent to identify facilities at BAT to site these phased activities before the opening of the Hub.

Q: Do all the uses have to be concentrated in the Primary Space?

A: Respondents may consider other spaces on BAT's campus for activation, such as other tenantable spaces, interior common areas, and outdoor and maritime areas, for example. However, the focus of proposals should be the 112,000 SF Primary Site located on floors 7-8 in Building A.

Q: What are the types of waterfront activations EDC is interested in seeing via the Climate Innovation Hub?

A: Along the waterfront, EDC is interested in seeing proposals that:

- Leverage the waterfront as part of Pilots at BAT to provide access to climate technology companies looking to demonstrate their solutions in live, urban environments*
- Propose potential improvements in maritime logistics (e.g. barging) to support Hub functions and operations*
- Activate the waterfront for Climate Innovation Hub events and programming for Hub participants, the broader Sunset Park community, and New Yorkers across the 5 boroughs to access climate tech business support, workforce development opportunities, and educational resources and events*

Q: Will the Climate Innovation Hub target specific disciplines or sectors?

A: NYCEDC has not specified target disciplines or sectors, as we encourage Respondents to propose their own programmatic vision for the Climate Innovation Hub. The Green Economy Action Plan, co-released in February 2024 by NYCEDC and the Mayor's Office of Talent and Workforce Development, is a useful guide for Respondents seeking to identify target sectors or disciplines to support NYC's green economy.

Q: Is there an example of an ideal project in the last 20 years Potential Respondents can use as a model for their Climate Innovation Hub proposals?

A: There is no comparable project NYCEDC can point to as a model. We encourage teams to conduct research to identify interesting models pursued in other cities and/or countries and propose their own visions for the Climate Innovation Hub.

Questions about BAT

Q: What are the current occupancy rates at BAT?

A: Of the space in an occupiable condition today (approximately 3.7M sf) 94% is occupied.

Q: Are there existing tenants that may have a crossover with the Climate Innovation Hub?

A: BAT is home to approximately 125 industrial businesses that collectively employ approximately 4,000 New Yorkers. There is a dynamic tenant mix that includes traditional, advanced and food manufacturers, artists, filmmakers, technology companies, environmental science R&D labs, and circular economy companies. For example, Makerspace, New York's largest maker studio, provides metal, woodworking, and other light manufacturing facilities for artists and small businesses, is a tenant at BAT.

Respondents can learn more about current tenants at BAT and access the Tenant Directory in Appendix 17, which includes profiles of BAT tenants, and <https://brooklynarmyterminal.com/tenants>. Collaboration with BAT tenants can be considered as part of Climate Innovation Hub proposals, but is not a requirement.

Q: What is the turnover rate for tenants at BAT?

A: Lease terms average 5-10 years. We have some tenants who have been in the building since the early 1990s.

Q: Are AUTOCAD files for the site available and posted?

A: AUTOCAD files for BAT Building A Floors 7-8 (the "Primary Site") are available for download on the RFP webpage.

Q: Does the building allow double height ceilings?

A: Yes, Respondents are required to include an architecturally striking common area in their Climate Innovation Hub proposals, sized at a minimum of 5,000 SF with double height ceilings that could be utilized for activities that may include convenings, pitch/demo days, conferences, lectures, etc.

Q: Have double height ceilings been created before at BAT?

A: There are currently no tenant spaces with double height ceilings at BAT. EDC has, however, completed work of similar scope when portions of floor area were removed to create building infrastructure such as freight elevator shafts.

Q: Why will it take 18 months to whitebox the Climate Innovation Hub Primary Site at BAT?

A: This is an estimate based on previously completed similar construction projects. Once the project moves into design development, NYCEDC will be able to provide a more granular timeline.

Q: Do the mechanical and elevator footprints already exist on the floor plans? What will be added?

A: Elevator shafts are part of the original building design. NYCEDC will utilize the empty shafts for future elevators and mechanical needs.

Q: How has the site withstood climate events?

A: A historic resiliency feature of BAT is that the built structures are sited uphill from the waterfront to prevent flooding, though there was some flooding in the basement of BAT's Building A during Hurricane Sandy. Resiliency upgrades have been factored into construction taking place, including dry and wet flood proofing of basements.

An upcoming FEMA project enhances climate resilience by raising the flood defense of Building A, which is currently only 2 to 3 feet above the seawall and therefore is vulnerable during storm surges. By installing a flood protection system at entryways and garage doors on the west side and integrating approximately 1400 linear feet of permanent flood barriers, EDC will significantly mitigate storm damage. These barriers, complete with necessary concrete footings and storm drainage systems, will not only prevent damage from sea level rise and storm surges, but also safeguard building infrastructure and minimize operational disruptions due to flooding.

Q: I'm looking for the report referenced in APPENDIX 15: UTILITY ANALYSIS AND UPGRADE CONSIDERATIONS AT BAT. It notes, "In 2022, at the request of the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS), Loring Consulting Engineers, Inc. (Loring) performed an energy audit and retro-commissioning study for Brooklyn Army Terminal, located at 140 58th Street, Brooklyn, NY 11220. The purpose of this study, published in October 2022 as the FY22 Energy Audits and Retro-Commissioning Report". Can EDC share?

A: NYCEDC will not be sharing that report at this time. Once proposals are received, NYCEDC will determine what information is most appropriate to share with Respondents.

Compliance Questions

Q: Do you have to provide documentation or MOUs in regards to working with underrepresented entities?

A: Partnership with underrepresented entities is encouraged. NYCEDC does not require MOUs as part of Climate Innovation Hub RFP proposals, but encourages inclusion of any documentation noting participation of underrepresented entities in a Consortium.

More information about M/WBE participation to develop the Climate Innovation Hub can be found in the ‘Questions and Answers Round 1’ document posted to the RFP webpage on April 29th.

Q: Can a subcontractor be part of multiple proposals?

A: Yes, a Consortium partner may be involved in multiple proposals.

Q: Is a market-standard Development Fee (or Promote) applicable within the Accounting Directive 10 or allowed in a foreseen Funding Agreement? If no, curious your views on how to remunerate Consortium Development Partners / Investment Partners.

A: The Developer Fee is not capitably eligible under Accounting Directive 10 and is not a reimbursable expense under a Funding Agreement.

With EDC as developer, developer fees are not applicable. If the team wishes to use its own developer, then it will need to finance those costs outside of the City Capital award.

Q: Is a Management Agreement with a profit share component a possible alternative to a sublease from NYCEDC?

A: EDC is open to a range of models and requires that all respondents mark-up the term-sheet included in the RFP package to reflect the proposed operating model including rent/payment structure.

Applicant Status and Selection Process

Q: What will the ideal respondents bring to the table?

A: NYCEDC is interested in ensuring that the various types of expertise laid out in the RFP are sufficiently met. Consortia should include entities that at a minimum have experience operating co-working/step out space, accelerators/incubators, lab/prototyping facilities, piloting and testing infrastructure, workforce and talent development programs, business support program and services (such as business development, accounting, legal, finance, etc.), raising capital from both public and private entities, and have industry knowledge of climate tech and sustainability.

Q: Based on EDC’s experience, what type of entity will be a good Lead Respondent?

A: The Lead Respondent will be responsible for organizing and managing the Consortium to develop, launch, and operate the Hub. The Lead Respondent must be well capitalized and have strong fundraising capabilities. Robust experience designing or operating real estate is also strongly preferred, but not required. The Lead Respondent will be the point of contact,

financially backstop the lease with EDC, and be accountable for the overall design and management of the Hub.

NYCEDC is not being prescriptive about which types of entities are eligible to submit a proposal as Lead Respondent, but Respondents should consider the above qualifications when assessing their readiness and capacity.

Q: Would EDC consider a Lead Respondent as an operator and guarantor?

A: A Lead Respondent can be both an operator and guarantor, but this is not a requirement. Please reference the RFP to understand the capacities and functions expected of a Lead Respondent.

Technical and Other Questions

Q: Is underwater acreage available as part of the current RFP only, or is it something EDC would run a separate RFP for?

A: Through this RFP, available areas for pier and waterfront activation at BAT include both the south and north sides of Pier 4, which are directly adjacent to BAT. Additionally, there is a fairway between ghost Piers 2 and 3, which were demolished by EDC years ago but are not visible to the naked eye. They are directly to the south of Pier 4. NYC Ferry travels a fairway between Pier 4 and the ghost of Pier 3. NYPD uses the fairway south of the ghost of Pier 2. The fairway between the ghosts of Piers 2 and 3 is presently used by no one and available via this procurement. The NYCEDC Sunset Park District Map on p. 11 of the RFP includes a visualization of Pier 4 and the available waterfront areas.

On behalf of NYCEDC, [DockNYC](#) is the program that operates and manages publicly owned waterfront sites in Manhattan, Brooklyn, and Staten Island as part of the city priority to activate key waterfront assets. The waterfront areas mentioned above can be activated by way of DockNYC licenses.

Respondents may integrate use of underwater acreage for these areas as part of their proposals to this RFP. There is not another RFP currently for leveraging underwater acreage at or near BAT, though climate tech companies may submit an application to Pilots at BAT if they are interested in piloting underwater.

Q: What are underwater land use and shadowing rights and capabilities?

A: Accessing waterfront infrastructure will likely require local, state and federal permits. The waterfront and land under water from BAT to the offshore pierhead line (land under water area from the nearshore bulkhead up to the waterward western end of BAT Pier 4) is City-owned property under the jurisdiction of the NYC SBS and controlled by NYCEDC via master lease. The Pierhead line ends at the precipice of a federal channel, which is federal infrastructure and therefore any encroachment into that area requires additional Army Corps permissions.

Additionally, accessing the area beyond the Pierhead line for underwater drone testing would likely require a Local Notice to Mariners via the U.S. Coast Guard.

For more information about permitting, [Waterfront Navigator](#) is NYCEDC's one-stop permitting information center for waterfront developers, providing a centralized source of information to help streamline the process of obtaining necessary permits.

Q: We understood that material for the Partner Forms would be shared among all who submitted. Please advise how this information will be shared.

A: No, the Partner Pool Packet was shared only with eligible entities who submitted a Partner Form. The Partner Form closed on April 19th and the Partner Pool packet is final and closed.

Q: Is it possible to reopen the Partner Form?

A: See response to the question above.

Q: Can Consortiums still be formed?

A: Yes. NYCEDC encourages formation of Consortiums before the proposal submission deadline on Friday, July 18th at 5pm. The formation of Consortiums is the responsibility of entities interested in applying to the RFP.

Q: How do we facilitate connections with other partners to form Consortia?

A: Entities that submitted a Partner Form can leverage the final Partner Pool packet to make connections with other partners to form Consortia. Consortiums can also include entities who did not submit a Partner Form.

If you did not submit a Partner Form, we encourage you to use the attendance sheets from Climate Innovation Hub Informational Sessions and Site Tours (posted on the procurement webpage). Please also connect with other potential partners in your network whom you think can deliver a required capacity for the Hub.

Q: I am currently identifying potential partners to develop a strong proposal and would appreciate any recommendations for groups or contacts you think we should collaborate with. Thank you once again for all your support and direction. I look forward to moving ahead swiftly with these exciting opportunities.

A: Please see response to the question above.

Q: What is the vision related to TGI and Yard Labs? How are they different?

A: Yard Labs is the piloting program operated by the Brooklyn Navy Yard Development Corporation (BNYDC), an entity participating in the Harbor Climate Collaborative (HCC). As

part of the HCC, NYCEDC is partnering very closely with BNYDC and with the Trust for Governors Island (TGI) to build a green economy ecosystem that leverages each of the partner's expertise in research and climate education, business support for emerging companies and solutions, preparing New Yorkers for well-paying jobs, and providing a home for new and existing businesses to scale in NYC's growing green economy.

There will be opportunities to pilot and scale climate technologies through the Pilots at BAT program at BAT, Yard Labs at the Brooklyn Navy Yard, and the Governors Island Living Lab, with additional purpose-built infrastructure at the Climate Innovation Hub. These resources are meant to be complementary so that climate solutions can be piloted in the best possible environment to support their commercialization. The Chosen Respondent will be integrated into ongoing HCC conversations to ensure seamless collaboration across the different programs across these three entities.

Q: For smaller organizations, what ways will EDC provide technical support with applications?

A: NYCEDC will not be providing technical support to any entities submitting a proposal for the Climate Innovation Hub.

Q: Is there any chance separate proposals will be complementary and can merge?

A: NYCEDC will evaluate proposals on their own merit and does not seek to merge proposals. However, NYCEDC reserves the right to further explore this question based on proposals received.

Q: Is EDC exploring creation of housing in the Sunset Park area?

A: NYCEDC is not currently exploring creation of additional housing in Sunset Park.

Q: My company produces next generation benchtop bioreactors, and we are located in Brooklyn. I think our hardware would be a valuable asset to the facility, so I'm wondering if there's someone I could speak to about this. We'd love to assist with building out/supplying the fermentation capabilities.

A: If inclusion of bioreactors is part of your vision for the Climate Innovation Hub, please engage other potential partners to form a Consortium and submit a proposal. To stay apprised of future opportunities, we encourage you to sign up for [NYCEDC's vendor list](#).